

PROOF OF (9.29) IN STEPS

I am including the proof of (9.29) as part exercise because the book says the proof can be done by modifying the short proof that it provides. As far as I can see it isn't that easy. Lemma 2 was a homework problem for the review questions for the final so consider this a solution to that problem. Make sure that you can fill in the reasons for each of the following steps of these proofs.

P.S. A 'Lemma' is another word for Theorem.

Lemma 1:

$$(\exists x | : true) \equiv true$$

$$\begin{aligned} true &\Rightarrow (\exists x | : true) - (9.28) \text{ with } P := true \\ &= \\ true \vee (\exists x | : true) &\equiv (\exists x | : true) \\ &= \\ true &\equiv (\exists x | : true) \end{aligned}$$

Lemma 2: Assume that x does not occur in Q , then

$$(\exists x | : Q \vee P) \equiv Q \vee (\exists x | : P)$$

$$\begin{aligned} (\exists | : true) &\Rightarrow ((\exists x | : Q \vee P) \equiv Q \vee (\exists x | : P)) - \text{ this is (9.23)} \\ &= \\ true &\Rightarrow ((\exists x | : Q \vee P) \equiv Q \vee (\exists x | : P)) \\ &= \\ (\exists x | : Q \vee P) &\equiv Q \vee (\exists x | : P) \end{aligned}$$

Lemma 3: If y does not occur in R_x , then

$$(\exists x|R_x : (\forall y| : P_{xy})) \Rightarrow (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy}))$$

Proof:

$$\begin{aligned}
& (\exists x|R_x : (\forall y| : P_{xy})) \Rightarrow (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\exists x|R_x : (\forall y| : P_{xy})) \vee (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \equiv (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : (\forall y| : P_{xy})) \vee (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \equiv (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy} \vee (\forall y| : P_{xy}))) \equiv (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \\
= & \text{< (9.13) } (\forall y| : P_{xy}) \Rightarrow P_{xy} \text{ which is equivalent to } (\forall y| : P_{xy}) \vee P_{xy} \equiv P_{xy} > \\
& (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \equiv (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy}))
\end{aligned}$$

Theorem (9.29): If y does not occur in R_x and x does not occur in Q_y , then

$$(\exists x|R_x : (\forall y|Q_y : P_{xy})) \Rightarrow (\forall y|Q_y : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy}))$$

Proof:

$$\begin{aligned}
& (\exists x|R_x : (\forall y|Q_y : P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\exists x|R_x : (\forall y| : \neg Q_y \vee P_{xy})) \\
\Rightarrow & \\
& (\forall y| : (\exists x|R_x : \neg Q_y \vee P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\forall y| : \neg Q_y \vee (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy})) \\
= & \\
& (\forall y|Q_y : (\exists x|R_x : P_{xy}))
\end{aligned}$$